Thank You!
Questions?

Food Innovation Districts
A Land Use Tool for Communities Seeking to Create and Expand a Regional Food Industry

April 27, 2010
Michigan State University
School of Planning, Design & Urban Research
Productive Landscapes

Managing the Food System

Agribusiness and Economic Strategies for the Future

Regional Planning

Policy Research

Outreach and Engagement

Economic Development

Social Equity

Environmental Sustainability

Community Engagement
Food Innovation Districts

A Land Use Tool for Communities Seeking to Create and Expand a Regional Food Industry

April 27, 2012
Michigan State University
School of Planning, Design & Construction Urban Planning Practicum

Nicholas Dansby
Zane Grennell
Michelle Leppek
Sean McNaughton
Marlon Phillips
Kirstie Sieloff
Claire Wilke
Presentation Sections

Project Overview

Infrastructure of Local Food Systems

Food Innovation Districts

FID: A Component Matrix

Building 58 Case Study

Business and Economic Strategies for FIDs

Regulatory & Non-Regulatory Strategies for FIDs

Findings and Recommendations
Project Overview
Project Goals

Assist clients in creating a portion of planning and economic development toolkit

- Define FID
- Determine best way to create and implement FIDs
- Research planning and economic development strategies
- Create matrix for practical assessment by communities
- Apply matrix to case studies, including Building 58
Clients

Patty Cantrell
Organizer, Regional Food Solutions, LLC

Kathryn Colasanti
Academic Specialist, MSU Center for Regional Food Systems

Laura Goddeeris
Academic Specialist, MSU Center for Regional Food Systems

Sarah Lucas
Regional Planner, NWMCOG

Matt McCauley
Director, Regional Planning & Community Development for the NWMCOG

Infrastructure of Local Food Systems
Planning for Food Systems

• In the past local food use planning overlooked by planners
• Within the last 10 years implications of food systems acknowledged:
  • Effects on land use through policy
  • Effects on built environment
  • Effects community
Importance of Local Food Systems

- Food is critical element of everyday life-has implications for everyone
- Local and regional food systems effect these aspects for an area:
  - Health
  - Wealth
  - Increased quality of life
The Food System

Source: Center for Agroecology and Sustainable Food Systems Social Issues Team and Graphic Artist Elliott Kuhn, 2004.
Definition of Food Hub

- Evolving Definition of Food Hubs
- USDA, Wholesome Wave, Horst et al. contribute to current definition
- Defined by Center for Regional Food Systems:
  - 1) Focused primarily on serving an intermediary role between regional producers and customers
  - 2) Operated as either a single business entity or under a single governance structure
Food Hub Inventory

Necessary Components and Amenities

- Local/Regional/ State Food
- Network (Distribution)
- Physical Location
- Storage of Wholesale goods
- Production Facility
- Educational Outreach
- Community Kitchen
- Sale of wholesale goods
- Processing
- Retail
Food Innovation Districts
Food Innovation Districts
Definition

- Distinct geographical location
- Close Proximity
- Goal is to agglomerate
- Create Network of food related businesses
- Benefit through exchange of services, facilities, ideas
Food Hub and FID
Similarities and Differences

Food Hub
- Single facility
- Serves as intermediary between customers and producers/farmers
- Single business entity or single governance structure

FID
- External connections (pulls resources from outside of the hub and aggregates)
- Retail, wholesale, producing/processing, warehousing
- Functions as an aggregate for producers
- Coordinated distribution

- Multiple facilities
- External AND internal connections (networking between entities within FID)
- Utilizes broader planning and economic development

Source: MSU Practicum Team 2012
Food Innovation District: A Component Matrix
Matrix Application

Step 1
- Define a geographic region

Step 2
- Identify a food hub within the region or an exterior food hub with connection potential

Step 3
- Apply the Matrix with Y/N model

Step 4
- Analyze the Strength of the FID and compare to existing FIDs

Source: MSU Practicum Team, 2012
## Component Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defined Area</th>
<th>Is a Food Hub in the defined area, or is there access to a nearby Hub?</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>Demographics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td>Yes, Eastern Market</td>
<td>13,777</td>
<td>Mixed Residential Housing, Central Business District, Commercial Community Shopping, Light Industrial, and Open Space</td>
<td>84.7% Black or African American, 6.3% White or Caucasian, and 8.0% Other Race</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland, CA</td>
<td>Yes, Mandela Foods Cooperative &amp; Thumbs Up Distributing</td>
<td>100,724</td>
<td>General Services District and General Industrial District</td>
<td>81.9% White or Caucasian, 25.0% Black or African American, and 20.0% Other Race</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wooster, OH</td>
<td>Yes, Local Roots Market &amp; Café</td>
<td>25,124</td>
<td>Light Industry, Single Family Residential, Retail Commercial, and Public/Semi-Public</td>
<td>81.2% White or Caucasian, 8.8% Black or African American, 2.7% Asian or Pacific Islander, and 1.9% Other Race</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defined Area</th>
<th>Is a Food Hub in the defined area, or is there access to a nearby Hub?</th>
<th>Wholesale District</th>
<th>Retail District</th>
<th>Planning &amp; Coordination</th>
<th>Distribution Network</th>
<th>Shared Storage Facilities</th>
<th>Processing Center</th>
<th>Marketing Services</th>
<th>Farm to School</th>
<th>Education Program</th>
<th>Community Supported Agriculture</th>
<th>Community Kitchen</th>
<th>Connection to Low-Income Individuals</th>
<th>Health Component</th>
<th>Policy Supported</th>
<th>Placemaking</th>
<th>Restaurant</th>
<th>Entertainment/Agriculture</th>
<th>Existing Food Cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td>Yes, Eastern Market</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland, CA</td>
<td>Yes, Mandela Foods Cooperative &amp; Thumbs Up Distributing</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wooster, OH</td>
<td>Yes, Local Roots Market &amp; Café</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MSU Practicum Team 2012
## Component Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defined Area</th>
<th>Is a Food Hub in the defined area, or is there access to a nearby Hub?</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>Demographics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td>Yes, Eastern Market</td>
<td>719,777</td>
<td>Mixed Residential Housing, Central Business District, Commercial Community Shopping, Light Industrial, and Open Space</td>
<td>82.7% Black persons, 10.6% White persons, and 6.9% Latino persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland, CA</td>
<td>Yes, Mandela Foods Cooperative &amp; Thumbs Up Distributing</td>
<td>880,724</td>
<td>General Services District and General Industrial District</td>
<td>74.5% White persons, 28.0% Black persons, 1.8% Asian persons, and 75.4% Latino persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wooster, OH</td>
<td>Yes, Local Roots Market &amp; Café</td>
<td>28,119</td>
<td>Light Industry, Single Family Residential, Retail Commercial, and Public/Semi Public</td>
<td>91.2% White persons, 3.4% Black persons, 2.2% Latino persons, and 1.9% Asian persons</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defined Area</th>
<th>Is a Food Hub in the defined area, or is there access to a nearby Hub?</th>
<th>Wholesale</th>
<th>Resale/Retail District</th>
<th>Planning &amp; Coordination</th>
<th>Distribution Network</th>
<th>Shared Storage Facilities</th>
<th>Processing Center</th>
<th>Marketing Services</th>
<th>Farm to School</th>
<th>Education Program</th>
<th>Community Supported Agriculture</th>
<th>Community Kitchen</th>
<th>Connection to Low-Income Individuals</th>
<th>Health Component</th>
<th>Policy Supported</th>
<th>Placemaking</th>
<th>Restaurant</th>
<th>Entertainment/Agritourism</th>
<th>Existing Food Cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td>Yes, Eastern Market</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland, CA</td>
<td>Yes, Mandela Foods Cooperative &amp; Thumbs Up Distributing</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place-Oriented Elements</th>
<th>Education Program</th>
<th>Community Supported Agriculture</th>
<th>Community Kitchen</th>
<th>Connection to Low-Income Individuals</th>
<th>Health Component</th>
<th>Policy Supported</th>
<th>Placemaking</th>
<th>Restaurant</th>
<th>Entertainment/Agritourism</th>
<th>Existing Food Cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detroit, MI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland, CA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Land Matrix

## Regional Descriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>Demographics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>713,777</td>
<td>Mixed Residential Housing, Central Business District, Commercial Community Shopping, Light Industrial, and Open Space</td>
<td>82.7% Black persons, 10.6% White persons, and 6.8% Latino persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>390,724</td>
<td>General Services District and General Industrial District</td>
<td>34.5% White persons, 28.0% Black persons, 16.8% Asian persons, and 25.4% Latino persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26,119</td>
<td>Light Industry, Single Family Residential, Retail Commercial, and Public/Semi Public</td>
<td>91.2% White persons, 3.6% Black persons, 2.2% Latino persons, and 1.9% Asian persons</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## User-Oriented Elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Food &amp; Nutrition</th>
<th>Distribution Network</th>
<th>Shared Storage Facilities</th>
<th>Processing Center</th>
<th>Marketing Services</th>
<th>Farm to School</th>
<th>Education Program</th>
<th>Community Supported Agriculture</th>
<th>Community Kitchen</th>
<th>Connection to Low-Income Individuals</th>
<th>Health Component</th>
<th>Policy Supported</th>
<th>Placemaking</th>
<th>Restaurant</th>
<th>Entertainment/Agritourism</th>
<th>Existing Food Cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Community-Oriented Elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place-Oriented Elements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resale/Retail District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Building 58 Case Study
Location

Arkyan, 2007

The Minervini Group, 2011
## Building 58 Matrix

### Producer-Oriented Elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defined Area</th>
<th>Wholesale District</th>
<th>Resale/Retail District</th>
<th>Planning &amp; Coordination</th>
<th>Distribution Network</th>
<th>Shared Storage Facilities</th>
<th>Processing Center</th>
<th>Marketing Services</th>
<th>Farm to School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Village at Grand Traverse Commons: Current</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village at Grand Traverse Commons: Future</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Community-Oriented Elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defined Area</th>
<th>Education Program</th>
<th>Community Supported Agriculture</th>
<th>Community Kitchen</th>
<th>Connection to Low-Income Individuals</th>
<th>Health Component</th>
<th>Policy Supported</th>
<th>Placemaking</th>
<th>Restaurant</th>
<th>Entertainment/Agritourism</th>
<th>Existing Food Cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Village at Grand Traverse Commons: Current</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village at Grand Traverse Commons: Future</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Place-Oriented Elements

Source: MSU Practicum Team, 2012
### Producer-Oriented Elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wholesale District</th>
<th>Resale/Retail District</th>
<th>Planning &amp; Coordination</th>
<th>Distribution Network</th>
<th>Shared Storage Facilities</th>
<th>Processing Center</th>
<th>Marketing Services</th>
<th>Farm to School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Community-Oriented Elements

| Education Program | Community Supported Agriculture | Community Kitchen | Connection to Low-Income Individuals | Health Component | Policy Supported | Placemaking | Restaurant | Entert |}

### Place-Oriented Elements

<p>| Policy Supported | Placemaking | Restaurant | Entert |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Program</th>
<th>Community Supported Agriculture</th>
<th>Community Kitchen</th>
<th>Connection to Low-Income Individuals</th>
<th>Health Component</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place-Oriented Elements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Supported</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placemaking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment/Agritourism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existing Food Cluster</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policy Supported</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placemaking</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment/Agritourism</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existing Food Cluster</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Building 58 Case Study

- Serves as an example for municipalities wanting to create or expand their assets into an FID
- Shows how to keep the integrity of historic structures while adapting them to suit the current needs of the population
Business and Economic Strategies for FIDs
Tools and Incentives

- Credits, TIF, BRA, and Abatements
  - Attract food-related businesses to invest into tax base
- Retain with incentives for:
  - Locating to the district
  - Business and labor growth
Placemaking

- Michigan Main Street
- Creates “sense of place”
Michigan Business Districts

- Models for implementing FIDs:
  - SmartZone
  - Renaissance Zone
  - Enterprise Zone

Source: MEDC (n.d.)
Regulatory & Non-Regulatory Strategies for FIDs
Barriers to Zoning for FIDs

- FIDs contain wide range of use intensities
- How to concentrate uses
- Regulatory limits to urban agriculture
- Right to Farm

Source: Niagara Frontier Publications, 2007
Source: Organic Garden Project, 2011
Zoning Types

- Permitted Use
  - Low maintenance
  - Jurisdiction must be specific in use

- Special Zoning Ordinance
  - May incorporate special community goals
  - Thorough approval process/financial constraints

- Overlay
  - Can add flexibility or restrict
  - Can be applied over multiple zones
  - May not create binding development pattern
Concepts to Consider

- Master plan/subplan
- Design guidelines
- Incentives
- Eco-industrial parks

Source: Kalundborg Eco-industrial Park, 2008
Findings and Recommendations
FID Matrix

- Useful to understand strengths and weaknesses
- Compare and contrast with existing food hubs
- Use as a tool to determine future action
Business and Economic Strategies for FIDs

- **Economic short-term actions:**
  - Incorporate local authorities for partnership with businesses
  - Connect clusters with outside markets
  - Implement tax strategies, where applicable

- **Economic long-term actions:**
  - Amendment to legislation for FID consideration into tax incentives
Regulatory and Non-Regulatory Strategies for FIDs

• Tailor zoning strategy to community needs
• Choose a zoning method that will concentrate uses
• Allow for flexibility and mix of uses
• Utilize a master plan/special plan
The Advancement of FIDs

How to advance FIDs locally:
• Findings from Building 58
• Utilize FID matrix to assess community strengths/weaknesses
• Use planning/business strategies

How to advance FIDs on a broader scale:
• Further research of FIDs
• Perform more case study analysis with matrix
Thank You!

Questions?
Thank You!
Questions?

Food Innovation Districts
A Land Use Tool for Communities Seeking to Create and Expand a Regional Food Industry

April 27, 2009
Michigan State University
School of Planning, Design & Urban Development
Urban Planning Program

Willett, Smiley
Community Planner
Michigan State University
School of Planning, Design & Urban Development
Urban Planning Program