MakeArt ShareSpace (M.A.S.S.)

Art Incubators and Makerspaces: An application in Benton Harbor
Michigan State University Urban Planning Practicum Team M.A.S.S.

Ben Fraser, David Hendrixon, Conor Ott, Binyu Wang, Eric Wedesky, Lindsay Westin
Outline

- Profile of Benton Harbor and the developing arts district
- Definitions
- Case Studies
- Characteristics
- Possible Site Locations
- Recommendations
Introduction

An assessment of Benton Harbor’s economy and the feasibility of establishing a hybrid of both an art incubator and makerspace.
We asked 3 questions

- Is Benton Harbor in need of alternative economic development options?
- What elements and characteristics compose these types of creative spaces?
- How might an art incubator, makerspace, or hybrid make-art share-space be incorporated into Benton Harbor’s Arts District?
Definitions
Definitions

- **Art Incubator**
  - Affordable spaces
  - Use of tools that artists might not have been able to access independently
  - Collaboration opportunities
  - Help artists efforts to start an arts-related business

- **Makerspace**
  - Helps those interested in science, technology, engineering, and crafts
  - Nurtures person to person interaction and collaboration
  - Provides common tools and technological equipment
Definitions

**M.A.S.S.**
- Consists of elements of both an art incubator and a makerspace
- Greater emphasis on education and public involvement

**Arts District**
- Operations aimed to promote economic development and cultural activity
- High concentrations of
  - Art organizations
  - Art-based businesses
  - Individual artists
  - Ancillary merchants
  - Public spaces
  - Public art
Location
Benton Harbor, MI
Benton Harbor’s Art District
Arts District

Situated downtown, just south of Harbor Shores Golf Course.

Benton Harbor Arts District
Arts District
# Arts District

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building</th>
<th>Educational Opportunities</th>
<th>Studio Space</th>
<th>Retail</th>
<th>Performances</th>
<th>Gallery</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water Street Glass Works</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna Russo Sieber Gallery</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Pillars Gallery</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wall Street Studios</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citadel Dance &amp; Music Centers</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Socioeconomic Profile

We compared Benton Harbor to the Tri-County Region and the State of Michigan
2012 Benton Harbor Racial Composition

- Black: 88%
- White: 5%
- Other: 7%

2012 Tri-County Region Racial Composition

- Black: 11%
- White: 10%
- Other: 79%

2012 State of Michigan Racial Composition

- Black: 14%
- White: 10%
- Other: 76%
2012 Household Income Distribution

Household Income Ranges

- $50,000-$74,999
- $35,000-$49,999
- $25,000-$34,999
- $15,000-$24,999
- <$15,000
- >$75,000

Amount of Households in a Given Range

- Michigan
- Tri-County Region
- Benton Harbor
No schooling - 12th grade, no diploma

- Michigan: 40%
- Tri-County Region: 20%
- Benton Harbor: 60%

High school graduate, GED, or alternative

- Michigan: 30%
- Tri-County Region: 25%
- Benton Harbor: 40%

Any college degree

- Michigan: 20%
- Tri-County Region: 30%
- Benton Harbor: 40%
Demographic Conclusions

- Young population
- Population composed primarily of Black citizens
- Households are experiencing low income levels
- Low levels of education attainment
North American Industrial Classification System

- Furniture & Home Furnishings
- Electronics & Appliances
- Clothing
- Shoes
- Jewelry, Luggage & Leather
- Sporting Goods, Hobby & Instruments
- Books, Periodicals & Music
- Miscellaneous
- Florists
- Used Merchandise
- Other Miscellaneous
- E-Shopping/Mail-Orders
- Full-Service Restaurants
- Drinking Places-Alcohol
Number Of Businesses Per 10,000 People

North American Industry Classification Categories

Businesses Per 10,000 People

- Furniture & Home Furnishings
- Electronics & Appliances
- Clothing
- Jewelry, Luggage & Leather
- Sporting Goods, Hobby, Instrument
- Books, Periodicals & Music
- Miscellaneous
- Used Merchandise
- Other Miscellaneous
- E-Shopping/Mail Orders
- Full-Service Restaurants
- Drinking Places-Alcohol
Socioeconomic Conclusions

- Benton Harbor is lacking businesses in 6 of 14 NAICS categories studied.

- M.A.S.S. could provide:
  - Education past high school.
  - Grounds for start up artists
  - Arts-related business creation
  - Economic development
Case Studies

Art Incubators
Case Studies

- Detroit Creative Corridor Center
- ART 634
- North Carolina Arts Incubator
- Arlington Arts Center
- Everett Lofts
## Defining Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature</th>
<th>AAC</th>
<th>Everett</th>
<th>Art 634</th>
<th>DC3</th>
<th>NCAI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part of Existing Arts District</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexible Leases</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Gallery Space</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-Sales</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdoor Space</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Case Studies

- Core mission aligns with the definitions of makerspaces and art incubators
- Useful framework
- Uses an existing building

Bucketworks

Mt. Elliot
# Defining Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Bucketworks</th>
<th>Mt. Elliot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Functional Prototypes</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Development</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Shared Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>AAC</th>
<th>Everett</th>
<th>Art 634</th>
<th>DC3</th>
<th>NCAI</th>
<th>Bucketworks</th>
<th>Mt. Elliot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Common Work Space</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Work Space</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Equipment</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentoring</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Opportunities</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet Access</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web Presence</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Possible Site Locations
Bobo Brazil Community Center

- City owned, vacant
- Located two blocks east of the arts district
- Approximately 24,000 sq. ft.
Benton Harbor Public Library

- City owned, Occupied
- Located one block from the arts district
- In the funding process of renovation plans
+ 200 Paw Paw

- City Owned, vacant
- Located 3 blocks east of the arts district
- Approximately 16,000 sq. ft.
Building Recommendation
# Building Proposal

## 200 Paw Paw

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Individual Work Space</th>
<th>Common Work Space</th>
<th>Common Event Space</th>
<th>Office Space</th>
<th>Internet Ready</th>
<th>Live/Work Space</th>
<th>Building Condition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bobo Brazil</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BHPL</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200 Paw Paw</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Average</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Financial and Community Involvement Recommendations
## Financial

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fixed Costs</th>
<th>Variable Costs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Production supplies</td>
<td>Direct materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renovation Costs</td>
<td>Staff wages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mortgage or lease</td>
<td>Utilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insurance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property Taxes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly bills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salaries</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Financial

Grants

Partnerships
Operations

Community Involvement
Final Thoughts
The team would like to thank

K. John Egelhaaf
Ryan Soucy
Jill Plescher
Rex LaMore
Zenia Kotval

Michigan State University
Questions?